**Handout for Phil102, 8/5/14**

* **Pope John Paul II, “The Unspeakable Crime of Abortion”**
* **Mary Anne Warren, “On the Moral and Legal Status of Abortion”**

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| **Pope’s Argument** | **Criticize P1** | **Criticize P2** |
| P1. A fetus is a person with the right to life.  P2. It is morally wrong to kill a person with the right to life.  Therefore, it is morally wrong to kill a fetus. (Abortion is immoral.) | Therefore, a fetus is not a person with the right to life. | Therefore, it is not morally wrong to kill a person with the right to lfie. |

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| **The Genetic Code Argument** | |
| **Pope’s Argument** | **Warren’s Criticism** |
| “Abortion is wrong because the fetus is, biologically speaking, a human being.” | Biological status  vs.  Moral status |

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| **Warren’s Criteria for Personhood** | |
| 1. Consciousness 2. Reasoning 3. Self-motivated activity 4. The capacity to communicate 5. The presence of self-concepts | * The more like a person a being is, the stronger the stronger its right to life is… * There is no stage of fetal development at which a fetus resembles a person enough to have a right to life… * “the rights of any actual person invariably outweigh those of any potential person” … |

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| **Warren’s Argument** | **Criticize P1** | **Criticize P2** |
| P1. If X lacks all 5 criteria, then X is not a person with full moral standing.  P2. A fetus lacks all 5 criteria.  Therefore, a fetus is not a person with full moral standing. | Therefore, it is not the case that *if X lacks all 5 criteria, then X is not a person with full moral standing*. | Therefore, a fetus does not lack all 5 criteria. |

**Warren’s Spaceman Analogy**

“Suppose that our space explorer falls into the hands of an alien culture, whose scientists decide to create a few hundred thousand or more human beings… with, of course, his genetic code. We may imagine that each of these newly created men will have all of the original man's abilities, skills, knowledge, and so on, and also have an individual self-concept, in short that each of them will be a bona fide … person.”

* + - ***Does he have an obligation to stay?  (Make an argument)***
    - Warren claims: ***NO***, not even if the clones have already started to grow and will die if he escapes.

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| Therefore, the spaceman has an obligation to stay. | Therefore, the spaceman does not have an obligation to stay. |

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| **The Infanticide Objection** | |
| **Objection** | **Warren’s Response** |
| “neonates are so very close to being persons that to kill them requires a very strong moral justification”  “once the infant is born, its continued life cannot … pose any serious threat to the woman's life or health, since she is free to put it up for adoption” | “when an infant is born into a society which-unlike ours-is so impoverished that it simply cannot care for it adequately without endangering the survival of existing persons, killing it or allowing it to die is not necessarily wrong”  “when an infant is born with such severe physical anomalies that its life would predictably be a very short and/or very miserable one, even with the most heroic of medical treatment, and where its parents do not choose to bear the often crushing emotional, financial and other burdens attendant upon the artificial prolongation of such a tragic life, it is not morally wrong…” |